

PIMA COUNTY COMMISSION ON TRIAL COURT APPOINTMENTS

MINUTES

December 18, 2019

PRESENT: Justice Andrew Gould, Chair; John Barry; Neal Eckel; Michael Hennessy; Marian Hill; Julie Katsel; Walter Nash; Richard Schaefer; Micah Schmit and Nanette Warner

ABSENT: Sherry Downer and Cassia Lundin

Justice Andrew Gould called the meeting to order at 8:41 a.m.

Introductions

Justice Gould introduced himself and welcomed the public present, the Commission members and apologized for the late start. He noted that the interviews will be followed by nominations to fill the judicial vacancy created by the retirement of Judge Charles Harrington.

Public Comment

Justice Gould called for public comment on the candidates being interviewed. He reminded the speakers they were limited to a couple minutes each and asked them not to repeat comments by previous speakers about the same candidate.

Richard Gordon spoke on behalf of Gary Cohen.
Richard Davis spoke on behalf of Gary Cohen.
John Munger spoke on behalf of Adriane Hofmeyr.
Victoria Otto spoke on behalf of J. Alan Goodwin.
Dr. Ann Einhorn spoke on behalf of Laurie San Angelo.

Approval of Minutes

Justice Gould asked if any member wished to submit changes or additions to the draft minutes of the screening meeting held on November 25, 2019. It was moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Disqualifications and Disclosures

Justice Gould asked the Commission members if there were any changes to the disqualifications and disclosures since the last meeting.

Nanette Warner reminded the Commission she was recused from voting on Adriane Hofmeyr's application.

Selection of Interview Questions

A motion to go into executive session for the purpose of selecting interview question was made at 8:58 a.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session at 10:06 a.m.

Investigation Reports

The Commission disclosed due diligence findings and reports for Gilbert Rosales Gary Cohen, Ken Sanders and Adriane Hofmeyr. They agreed to continue the reports on the remaining candidates after lunch.

Interviews of Applicants

From 10:50 a.m. to 12:30 p.m. the Commission interviewed Gary Cohen, Gilbert Rosales, Adriane Hofmeyr and Ken Sanders.

The Commission recessed for lunch from 12:30 p.m. to 1:06 p.m.

The Commission disclosed the due diligence reports for Matthew Messmer, Jeffrey Sklar, J. Alan Goodwin and Laurie San Angelo.

From 1:27 p.m. to 3:28 p.m. the Commission interviewed Matthew Messmer, Jeffrey Sklar, Laurie San Angelo and J. Alan Goodwin.

Discussion of Applicants and Interviews

Justice Gould reminded Commission members of the constitutionally required balance of political affiliations among nominees. He added that he would not be voting unless there was a tie.

The Commission took turns to discuss the interviews and the qualifications of the candidates in the order they were interviewed.

Justice Gould asked the Commission if a straw vote was needed to determine if any strong consensus existed on the potential nomination list. The Commission agreed, and the results of the straw vote were:

Gary Cohen – 8
J. Alan Goodwin – 8
Adriane Hofmeyr – 2
Matthew Messmer – 1
Gilbert Rosales, Jr. – 1
Laurie San Angelo – 9
Ken Sanders – 9
Jeffrey Sklar – 5

Justice Gould opened the floor for individual nominations to a tentative list.

Richard Schaefer moved to add Gary Cohen to the tentative list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 8-1-1 with Justice Gould abstaining.

Julie Katsel moved to add J. Alan Goodwin to the tentative list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 9-0-1 with Justice Gould abstaining.

Nanette Warner moved to add Laurie San Angelo to the tentative list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 9-0-1 with Justice Gould abstaining.

Marian Hill moved to add Ken Sanders to the tentative list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 8-1-1 with Justice Gould abstaining.

Mike Hennessy moved to add Jeffrey Sklar to the tentative list. The motion failed by a vote of 4-5-1 with Justice Gould abstaining.

Neal Eckel moved to close nominations and finalize the list of **Gary Cohen, J. Alan Goodwin, Laurie San Angelo** and **Ken Sanders** as the final slate for this vacancy to be submitted to the Governor. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 9-0-1 with Justice Gould abstaining.

Justice Gould thanked the Commission members for their hard work.

Adjournment

At 4:28 p.m., it was moved that the meeting be adjourned. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.